

## **Education Report: Early Childhood Education Proposed Work Programme**

---

### **Executive Summary**

---

The purpose of this paper is to present a work programme for the Ministry of Education to achieve the Government's initiatives for early childhood education.

The Government's initiatives include:

- Enhancing 20 Hours Early Childhood Education;
- Tackle the early childhood teacher shortage;
- Reduce adult/child ratios in early childhood centres;
- Reduce bureaucracy for early childhood centres; and
- Boost participation in early childhood care and education.

This paper presents an assessment of each of the proposed initiatives including policy choices, funding implications, implementation options and advice on the impact on education and care of children and value for money.

As investment in early childhood education is one of the strongest levers available to government to address educational under-achievement, we recommend a focused approach on improving access to a range of high quality, responsive early childhood provision for Māori and Pasifika and low socio-economic communities.

### **Recommended Actions**

---

It is recommended that the Minister of Education:

#### **20 Hours ECE**

- a. agree the 20 Hours ECE policy intent is still to encourage participation in high quality ECE over time by reducing the cost to parents.

**AGREE** / DISAGREE

- b. agree the following policy parameters for 20 Hours ECE:
- The subsidy for this policy is intended to replace fees charged by ECE services for up to 20 hours a week;
  - ECE services cannot charge a fee for those 20 hours;
  - Parents can be asked to pay optional charges and donations but cannot be declined enrolment if they do not agree;

- Subsidy levels will aim to cover 100 percent of the average hourly cost of providing ECE.

AGREE /  DISAGREE

- c. agree that the Ministry of Education will advise on policy changes, budget implications, and implementation options to give effect to the 20 Hours ECE policy by 27 February 2009

AGREE /  DISAGREE

- d. agree to announce changes to the attestation form parents complete to access 20 hours ECE to reduce compliance costs for ECE services, prior to the next funding round on 1 March 2009.

AGREE /  DISAGREE

#### Ratio Improvements

- e. agree that the Ministry of Education will provide further advice by 27 February 2009 on other more cost-effective ways to improve the quality of education and care than ratio improvements, and the budget, operational and implementation implications of government's proposed ratio improvements for under two year olds and of having a different set of teacher qualification requirements for under-tuos.

AGREE /  DISAGREE

- f. agree to seek Cabinet agreement by 31 March 2009 to rescind ratio improvements scheduled for 2009 and 2010.

AGREE /  DISAGREE

- g. agree to announce to the ECE sector ~~before the end of 2009~~ your intention to rescind previously agreed ratio changes while you consider government's proposals to improve ratios for under two year olds.

AGREE /  DISAGREE

h.

9(2)(f)(iv)

i.

9(2)(f)(iv)

j.

### **Boosting Participation**

- k. **agree** that the Ministry of Education will provide you with terms of reference and a project plan for the Counties Manukau project by 31 March 2009 and provide quarterly progress reports on the project and update Cabinet annually.

AGREE / DISAGREE

- l. **agree** that the Ministry of Education will provide you with advice on options for improving the collection of participation data in ECE by 16 January 2009.

AGREE / DISAGREE

- m. **note** that you have previously agreed that the Ministry of Education will provide you with advice on the review of ECE participation policies and the Discretionary Grants Scheme by 27 February 2009.

- n. **note** that you have received advice in a previous report on Improving the Quality of the Government's Investment in Education on 11 December 2008.

### **Reducing Bureaucracy**

- o. **agree** that the scope of the review of regulations covers the main changes in the 2008 regulations and particular requirements that have caused concern:

- Having regulatory criteria to assess compliance with regulatory standards;
- Six yearly re-licensing;
- Maximum centre size;
- Limited Attendance Centres;
- Minimum age of carers in home-based education and care services;
- Separate sleep rooms;
- Written risk assessments for home-based services;
- Police checks;
- Plumbed-in wash facilities; and
- The level of fees that should apply to a licence.

- p. **agree** that the review also identify non-education regulatory requirements that may be current barriers to ECE and advise on how those might be addressed.

AGREE / DISAGREE

q. agree to consult at the same time on the frequency of funding payments, which the government has identified as a consideration for enhancing 20 hours ECE.

AGREE  DISAGREE

r. agree to a paper to Cabinet seeking approval for consultation on 23 February 2009.

AGREE  DISAGREE

s. agree that the Ministry of Education develop a consultation paper which:

- outlines background information and key requirements from the 2008 system and the results of previous consultation; and
- invites comment on whether the requirements are supported and necessary and the identification of other funding or regulatory requirements considered unnecessary and how they should be changed while maintaining the quality of education and care.

AGREE  DISAGREE

t. agree to either Option A or Option B on the provision of advice on the results of consultation:

Option A: The Ministry of Education will analyse and report back to you.

AGREE  DISAGREE

Option B: Establish an ECE sector working group to analyse the comments and prepare advice for you on how to respond in consultation with a parent reference group.

AGREE  DISAGREE

u. note that Option B is the ministry's preferred option.

**Rawiri Brell**  
Deputy Secretary  
Early Childhood and Regional Education

**Hon Anne Tolley**  
Minister of Education

17/12/08.

## **Education Report: Early Childhood Education – Proposed Work Programme**

---

### **Purpose of Report**

---

1. This paper seeks your agreement to a work programme to achieve the Government's initiatives for early childhood education (ECE).
2. A brief assessment of each initiative is provided covering policy choices, whether new or reallocated funding would be required, when each initiative could be implemented, advice on the impact on education and care of children and value for money.

### **Background**

---

3. Investment in ECE is one of the strongest levers available to government to address educational under-achievement. While research on the educational impact of high quality ECE indicates positive benefits for all children, the greatest benefit is for those from low socio-economic backgrounds.
4. Considerable investment has already been made in universal access to ECE and raising qualification levels of the ECE teacher workforce. The benefits from this investment have not been fully realised for Māori, Pasifika and low socio-economic communities. In those communities participation rates in ECE have levelled off, and teacher supply is probably not sufficient to support increased growth in access. The projected population growth in these communities will result in lower rates of participation in ECE unless resourcing is targeted directly to improving access in those communities.
5. We would recommend that investment now focuses on improving access to a range of high quality, responsive ECE provision for Māori and Pasifika and low socio-economic communities. Such investment is likely to represent better value for money than continuing to invest in universal policies.
6. One of the key factors affecting the sector is supply of qualified teachers. To date, initiatives to improve quality have been focussed on increasing the number of qualified teachers in services. Research has shown that having qualified ECE teachers can support improved educational outcomes. However, improving access to ECE may be constrained by limited supply of qualified ECE teachers. Significant investment has already been made to provide incentives to study and to support ECE services to meet the teacher registration targets.  

9(2)(g)(i)
7. The government's proposed initiatives provide an opportunity for, and challenge to improving access to high quality ECE.

## 20 Hours Free Early Childhood Education (20 Hours ECE)

### **Policy Commitment**

8. The Government signalled its intention to enhance 20 Hours ECE through:
- removing 'Free' from the title
  - keep existing subsidies and fee controls
  - remove the 6-hours-a-day limit
  - include Playcentres and kōhanga reo and 5-year-olds in the present scheme
  - investigate more frequent payment periods.

### **Opportunities and Considerations**

9. The Government has indicated it wants to remove the term 'free' from this policy, but retain existing subsidies and fee controls. We ask you to confirm the policy intent is still to encourage participation in high quality ECE over time by reducing the cost to parents. We also ask you to confirm, consistent with that intent, the following policy parameters for 20 Hours ECE:
- a. The subsidy for this policy is intended to replace fees charged by ECE services for up to 20 hours a week;
  - b. ECE services cannot charge a fee for those 20 hours;
  - c. Parents can be asked to pay optional charges and donations but cannot be declined enrolment if they do not agree; and
  - d. Subsidy levels will aim to cover 100 percent of the average hourly cost of providing ECE.
10. The 20 Hours ECE policy is only likely to improve access to ECE for low socio-economic groups over the long-term because it addresses affordability rather than lack of access. A greater impact on improving access to ECE for low socio-economic groups could be achieved by investing the new funding required for enhancements to 20 Hours ECE in establishing a range of new ECE services in communities with the lowest participation rates.
11. The remaining changes proposed will incur considerable cost through more ECE services being eligible for funding, and more hours being claimed. Significant changes to ministry funding systems will be required, which will also require additional funding, and may take up to 18 months to implement.
- 12.

9(2)(f)(iv)

13. Playcentre recently published a report seeking an increase in government funding. This included a recommendation that they be included in the previous government's 20 hours policy, but also sought further funding to assist with administrative functions.
14. A review in 2007 of the processes used for claiming 20 hours ECE funding has resulted in the processes being simplified. The process changes have not yet been implemented and may provide an early opportunity for a reduction in compliance requirements for services. We recommend that you announce the changes to the attestation form parents complete to access 20 Hours ECE before the next funding round on 1 March 2009.
15. Further advice will be provided by 27 February 2009 on policy changes required to implement 20 Hours ECE, budget implications, and options for implementing the changes, including what could be implemented in 2009, 2010 and beyond.

### **Reducing Staff Ratios**

---

16. Government has proposed the following adult:child ratios improvement:
  - reduce the adult:child ratio for children under-two from 1:5 to 1:4
  - ensure that, after 2012, sessions for the under-twos in teacher-led ECE centres are staffed by at least 50% qualified teachers.

### **Opportunities and Considerations**

#### ***Improving adult:child ratios***

17. Lower ratios of adults to children have been shown in research to correlate with higher quality education and care, leading to improved educational outcomes for children. The research does not identify an optimal ratio, and many services in New Zealand operate with better ratios than that required in regulation. New Zealand ratios sit in the middle of the range of comparable countries. Comparable improvements in quality might also be obtained for lower cost by expanding the provision of professional development and teaching and learning resources.
18. The previous government agreed to improve adult: child ratios for children aged between two and three years of age because that age group had poor ratios compared to other countries. These changes are summarised below. Funding of approximately \$75m per annum has been appropriated to implement the 2009 and 2010 ratio changes, but not for improvements beyond that. Changes to regulations necessary to bring the 2009 and 2010 ratio changes into force have not been made yet.

<b>2009</b>	<b>2010</b>	<b>Agreed in principle (Not formally announced)</b>
Change to age split from under 2 and over 2 to under 2.5 and over 2.5	Change to the sessional ratio for over 2.5 from 1:15 to 1:14	Change to sessional ratio for over 2.5 from 1:14 to 1:13  Change to all-day and sessional ratio for under 2.5 from 1:5 to 1:4

19. The lack of a clear research finding on optimal ratio levels means the Government's proposed ratio changes could justifiably be implemented in place of those agreed by the previous government. Keeping the age split at two years instead of two and a half years would require less change to the operations of ECE centres and lower compliance costs. A timely announcement to the ECE sector of your intentions would provide time for services to consider what changes they would need to make to staffing levels and operations.

20. We recommend that you agree to:

- a. further advice by 27 February 2009 on other more cost-effective ways to improve the quality of education and care than ratio improvements, and the budget, operational and implementation implications of government's proposed ratio improvements for under two year olds;
- b. seek Cabinet agreement by 31 March 2009 to rescind ratio improvements scheduled for 2009 and 2010; and
- c. announce to the ECE sector before the end of 2008 your intention to rescind previously agreed ratio changes while you consider government's proposals to improve ratios for under two year olds.

***Qualification requirements for under-twos in teacher-led ECE services***

21.

22.

9(2)(f)(iv)

23.

24.

**Tackling Teacher Shortages**

---

**Policy Commitment**

25. The government has said it would tackle a shortage of qualified teachers by:

- promoting working while training;

- allowing qualified English-speaking foreign teachers to qualify after an intensive six-week programme; and
- allowing Montessori, Steiner and Playcentre qualifications to count towards the degree.

### **Opportunities and Considerations**

26. While research identifies that teacher qualifications are related to better educational outcomes for children, it does not point to a specific level or type of qualification, nor an optimal qualification rate for the teaching workforce. About 60% of the ECE workforce in teacher-led ECE centres are now qualified, which provides a significant professional base on which to improve quality in ways other than continuing to increase the qualification rate. Expanding professional learning and provision of teaching and learning resources may be a more cost effective way to ensure better educational outcomes for children are realised.
27. The 2010 teacher registration target would require 80% of teachers to be registered, with up to 10% of teachers in study counting towards that requirement. No decisions have been made on whether or not to regulate that target, or how to regulate it. Ministry forecasting indicates that the 2010 target would be the most difficult to meet because of the strong growth in new ECE services and the number of teachers still in training. Given that it can take between three and six years to gain the Diploma in Teaching (ECE), short term efforts to increase teacher supply are not likely to make the 2010 target more achievable.
- 28.
- 29.
- 30.
- 31.

9(2)(f)(iv)

32.

33.

9(2)(f)(iv)

34.

## **Boosting Participation**

---

### **Policy**

35. Government has indicated it will work with community groups, private centres, home-based providers, and local government to develop local solutions that best meet the early childhood needs of communities.

### **Opportunities**

36. The greatest barrier to participation over the foreseeable future is the availability of ECE services. The children with the most to gain from access to ECE are also those least likely to participate. Analysis of growth in ECE provision indicates that it is too slow in areas of lowest ECE participation to meet projected population growth. Private ECE providers have not materially expanded provision in the lowest socio-economic communities, and government funded capital projects are only making a small impact.
37. The ministry started a project early this year in the Counties Manukau area to develop a regional plan to improve ECE participation. The approach to this work is to engage local government, community groups, ECE providers and teacher education providers to commit to improving access to ECE.

38. The Counties Manukau project is working on a range of practical actions to increase access:
- a. development of network plans to target existing government resources for establishing ECE services on school and other Crown-owned land, local government property, and sites owned by community-focussed organisations such as churches and interest groups;
  - b. development of home-based networks in Māori, Pasifika, low socio-economic, refugee and migrant communities that target their particular needs;
  - c. expansion of playgroups which can be established quickly and tailored to meet particular community needs;
  - d. providing incentives to expand teacher education provision in the Counties Manukau area;
  - e. develop new and expand existing ECE support services and business development advisory services to strengthen community capability to effectively manage and govern services; and
  - f. develop local management services to provide support for community-based ECE provision.
39. We recommend that we provide you with the terms of reference and a project plan on the Counties Manukau project by 31 March 2009 and provide quarterly progress reports on the project and update Cabinet annually.
40. It is also important to note that our ability to identify areas of highest need, advise you on participation in ECE, and report on the costs and benefits of policies, is currently constrained by the low quality of data available. For example, we are unable to state definitively how many children are participating in ECE.
41. We consider it important to improve the quality of our data by making changes that will enable us to analyse ECE participation at a disaggregate per-child level. This change will enable us to target policies effectively to those areas and children who will gain most benefit. We recommend that we advise you on the options for improving the collection of participation data by 16 January.
42. We have also said we would provide you with advice on a review of ECE participation policies and the Discretionary Grant Scheme (funds for community groups to establish new ECE services) by 27 February 2009.
43. Please note that you have already received a report entitled *Improving the Quality of the Government's Investment in Education* on 11 December 2008 (refer to Metis 307201). The advice on value for money in ECE recommended in this report can form part of the advice on boosting participation.

## Reducing Bureaucracy and Regulations

### **Policy**

44. The Government has signalled its intention to remove unnecessary regulations over time.

### **Opportunities and Considerations**

45. The regulatory framework for ECE was reviewed between 2004 and 2008. The review sought to clarify rather than raise existing requirements. The resulting 2008 regulations also collapse Charters (a funding agreement) and Desirable Objectives and Practices into the regulations to reduce over-lapping requirements. A third tier of regulation called criteria was developed to establish how the regulatory standards would be assessed.
46. Other changes included adding new licence types, recognising playgroups (rather than existing by exemption), providing flexibility through temporary relocation licences and allowing mixed licence types. While clarifying requirements and removing duplication would be expected to reduce compliance costs, the regulatory review did not explicitly review the necessity of particular regulations with a view to reducing compliance costs.
47. On 1 December 2008 Cabinet agreed to a review of the 2008 ECE regulations to ensure that they operate fairly across the ECE sector. Work is also underway to make a limited range of amendments to the 2008 regulations to address some of the most pressing concerns while the review is underway.
48. The six-month review will provide an opportunity to ask ECE services to identify other unnecessary requirements, including funding rules and how the ministry carries out licensing.
49. Many of the regulatory compliance costs faced by ECE services concern resource management, local government, public health, building and housing and other non-education requirements.

### **Regulatory Review Scope**

50. Section 317(2)(b) the Education Act 1989 requires the Minister of Education to consult on changes to criteria that may be the result of a regulations review. We will provide you with a paper on 23 January 2009 to seek Cabinet approval for consultation.
51. Regulation 25 of the 1998 Regulations allows for the payment of a fee for licensing. There is no provision for licensing fees in the 2008 system and until fees are set, there will be a zero cost for new services to become licensed. There is a requirement to consult with the ECE sector before new fees can be set.
52. We propose that in order to complete the review of regulations within six months, the scope cover the main changes in the 2008 regulations and particular requirements that have caused concern:

- Having regulatory criteria to assess compliance with regulatory standards;
  - Six yearly re-licensing;
  - Maximum centre size;
  - Limited Attendance Centres;
  - Minimum age of carers in home-based education and care services;
  - Separate sleep rooms;
  - Written risk assessments for home-based services;
  - Police checks;
  - Plumbed-in wash facilities; and
  - The level of fees that should apply to a licence.
53. We propose that the six month review also identify non-education requirements that may be current barriers to ECE and advise on how those might be addressed.
54. We also recommend consulting at the same time on the frequency of funding payments, which the government has identified as a consideration for enhancing 20 hours ECE.

#### **Consultation and Advice**

55. We propose a consultation paper be prepared outlining background information and key requirements from the 2008 system. The paper would invite comment on whether those requirements are supported and necessary. The paper would also invite ECE services to identify any other funding or regulatory requirements they consider unnecessary, and how they should be changed while maintaining the quality of education and care.
56. There are two options for developing advice on the results of the consultation. The first is for the ministry to analyse the comments and report back to you.
57. The second option is to convene an ECE sector working group to analyse the comments and prepare advice for you on how to respond in consultation with a parent reference group. Under this option the ministry would provide secretarial support, draft the group's report, and provide advice on the implications of the group's recommendations. The advantage of this option is that the advice would reflect the operational experience of ECE providers. The main drawback is that a representative group may not be able to reach a consensus, but that could be managed by asking them to advise you on options where they could not agree.
58. We would also suggest establishing a parent reference group that would work with the ECE sector working group on ensuring any changes to regulations adequately promote the safety and well-being of children.

59. The following timeline is proposed:

23 January	Cabinet committee paper seeking approval to consult (includes a consultation document)
2 February	Six week consultation begins
19 March	Analysis of consultation feedback
22 April	Formal issue of drafting instructions to Parliamentary Counsel Office
20 May	Regulations to Cabinet Legislation Committee for authorisation to go to Executive Council
25 May	Regulations go to Executive Council. The regulations can be signed off by Governor General on the same day.
28 May	Regulations notified in the New Zealand Gazette
1 July 2009	2009 regulations come into force

#### Consultation Risks

60. The sector was extensively consulted during the development of the 2008 regulations during June-October 2006, and again this year. There is a risk that they will be reluctant to engage in the 2009 consultation process, particularly if there are a large number of issues for discussion. To mitigate this, the sector could be provided with a summary of the outcome of the previous consultation. This would provide an opportunity to confirm or change their earlier input.
61. The new Part 26 of the Education Act 1989 requires that all services be re-licensed by 2014. Any lengthy period of review lessens the amount of time we have to re-licence approximately 3,500 ECE services should that feature of the regulations continue.

(2)

5 February 2009

IM60/100/52/3  
ED05/25/00/1

**Education Report: Tackling Teacher Shortages in the Early  
Childhood Education Sector**

---

**Executive Summary**

---

The previous government introduced a series of teacher registration targets for teacher-led services. The aim was to improve the quality of early childhood education (ECE) provision in New Zealand by increasing the numbers of qualified teachers.

9(2)(g)(i)

The supply of qualified teachers in ECE is linked with the quality of ECE provision. The optimal level of qualified teachers required by a service to sustain the quality of ECE necessary to maximise educational benefits has not been established. More work needs to be done to determine if high levels of qualified teachers is the most cost effective way of improving quality.

9(2)(f)(iv)

9(2)(f)(iv)

Recommended Actions

It is recommended that the Minister of Education:

- a. agree to meet with officials to discuss options for raising quality other than current teacher registration targets and the possibility of consulting the sector on these matters;

AGREE / DISAGREE

b.

c.

9(2)(f)(iv)

d.

e.

9(2)(f)(iv)

f.

g.

9(2)(f)(iv)

h.

i.

9(2)(f)(iv)

j.

k.

9(2)(f)(iv)

**Rawiri Brell**  
Deputy Secretary  
Early Childhood and Regional Education

enc

**Hon Anne Tolley**  
Minister of Education

14,2,09

## **Education Report: Tackling Teacher Shortages in the Early Childhood Education Sector**

---

### **Purpose of Report**

---

1. This report gives an overview of the supply of teachers in the early childhood education (ECE) sector and provides advice about the government's manifesto commitments. It also seeks your advice about how you wish to progress the teacher registration targets.

### **Background**

---

2. The previous government introduced a series of teacher registration targets for teacher-led services. The aim was to improve quality in ECE by increasing the numbers of qualified registered teachers alongside other quality improvements such as ratio changes. The 2007 target has been implemented and is outlined below:

- **2007** – at least 50% of teaching staff working in teacher-led services must hold a recognised qualification. This target is regulated for and services that do not meet regulatory requirements are placed on 12 month provisional licences pending closure. As at 4 February 2009, 24 services were on provisional licences for not meeting the 50% qualified teacher requirement.

The remaining targets are:

- **2010** – at least 80% of teaching staff working in teacher-led services must be registered, with up to 10% of teachers studying for a recognised qualification counting towards that requirement.
  - **2012** – 100% of teaching staff working in teacher-led services must be registered, with up to 30% of teachers in studying for a recognised qualification counting towards that requirement.
3. As at 1 July 2008, 61% of teachers in teacher-led services were qualified and a further 18% were studying towards a qualification that leads to registration.
  4. Supporting quality in ECE involves supporting positive, sensitive and responsive interactions between staff and children. A focus on teacher qualifications aims to support better interaction between teachers and children. However, there is no evidence to suggest that focusing on teacher qualifications in isolation will have the desired effect on quality in ECE. It is the combination of teacher qualifications with other factors that support quality, such as teacher: child ratios and ongoing professional learning that will support high quality teaching practice.

5. The Diploma of Teaching (ECE) and the Bachelor of Teaching (ECE) are the benchmark qualification against which all other qualifications, including overseas qualifications, are measured. These qualifications were designed to equip teachers with quality teaching practices that are related to better outcomes for children.

## Comment

### **Teacher Supply Pressures**

6. Meeting the teacher registration targets and staffing new services established in response to the rising birth-rate are contributing to increasing demand for qualified ECE teachers.
7. As at 21 January 2009, projections indicated there will not be enough qualified teachers to meet the 2010 teacher target. Approximately 1,500 extra qualified teachers, on top of current projections, will be required for the sector to meet the 2010 target across all services.

### **Teacher Qualification and Registration Targets**

8. Before new approaches to increasing teacher supply are discussed, you may like to consider revising the teacher registration targets. Establishing a 100% qualified and registered ECE workforce may not be the most cost effective way of improving the quality of ECE. Research identifies that teacher qualifications are linked to better educational outcomes for children<sup>1</sup>. It does not point to a specific level or type of qualification, nor an optimal qualification rate for the teaching workforce.
9. It is unlikely that the sector will reach the 2010 target. You may like to consider alternative approaches to the teacher targets. Options include:
  - postponing the target dates;
  - continue funding rate incentives but do not regulate the 2010 or 2012 targets so services reach the targets as teacher supply allows;
  - lower or broaden the benchmark qualification to attract a wider potential workforce; and
  - invest in other ways of improving quality such as professional development.
10. Ministry officials are seeking a discussion with you about your preferred option and the possibility of consulting the sector about the teacher registration targets.

<sup>1</sup> Outcomes of Early Childhood Education: Literature Review L Mitchell, C Wylie and M Carr (2008) contains a summary of relevant research.

**9(2)(f)(iv)**

2008

9(2)(f)(iv)

9(2)(f)(iv)

24.

9(2)(f)(iv)

**Education Report: Tackling ECE Teacher Shortages**

---

**Executive Summary**

---

The Government's manifesto pledges to tackle teacher shortages, within its work to raise education standards and build opportunity for all New Zealanders. Qualified teachers are an important contribution to lifting standards in early childhood education (ECE).

The previous Government's ECE Strategic Plan set out the goal of a 100% qualified teaching workforce by 2012. Intermediate targets were set – 50% by 2007, 80% by 2010. Government undertook to meet the cost of additional teachers so that these costs were not passed on to parents, ensuring participation was not constrained by the affordability of quality improvements. Currently, the system regulates to 50% teachers, but will fund up to 100% in individual services if teachers are available.

The previous Government's target of 80% of teachers qualified by 2010 may not be achievable in over a third of services. Recent increases in the teaching workforce have been offset by increases in numbers of services, participation, and an uneven distribution of new teachers across services. Some evidence indicates a shortage of qualified teachers will constrain participation. This is particularly true of immersion and bilingual ECE services, and services catering to low-income communities.

We cannot be sure that ongoing increases in numbers will significantly increase the quality of education and care.

Your approach to the level of qualified teachers in the system, and the subsequent approach to setting, enforcing (through regulation) and 9(2)(f)(iv) any targets, will have the biggest impact on teacher shortages. Your broad options are to:

- Not regulate the 2010 80% target, but retain the option of regulating the 2012 100% target.
- Extend the deadline for both the 2010 and 2012 targets.
- Not regulate the 2010 80% target and remove the 2012 100% target.

9(2)(f)(iv)

9(2)(f)(iv)

As a next step, we can prepare a paper for you to seek Cabinet agreement in principle to an approach to next year's target. We can also discuss the proposals and their impacts with selected sector groups in confidence, if you wish.

**Recommended Actions**

---

We recommend that you:

- a. **note** that a shortage of teachers means the previous Government's 2010 target of 80% will be difficult to achieve
- b. **agree** that a Cabinet paper be prepared by late August setting out any of the options below, or any other option you may prefer:

- i. not regulate the 2010 80% target, but retain the option of regulating the 2012 100% target,

AGREE / **DISAGREE**

- ii. extend the timeframe on both targets,

AGREE / **DISAGREE**

or

- iii. *move the* not regulate the 2010 80% target *to 2012,* and remove the 2012 100% target,

**AGREE** / DISAGREE

c. 9(2)(f)(iv)

d. 9(2)(f)(iv)

*Next steps*

- e. ~~agree~~ we will discuss confidentially these proposals, and their implementation with early childhood groups (names to be confirmed with your office)

AGREE  DISAGREE

f.

9(2)(f)(iv)

**Karl Le Quesne**  
Group Manager  
Early Childhood Education

**Hon Anne Tolley**  
Minister of Education

5/8/09

## **Education Report: Tackling ECE Teacher Shortages**

---

### **Purpose**

---

1. This report proposes approaches to the 2010 teacher targets, and Government's manifesto commitment to tackle teacher shortages.

### **Background**

---

2. The Government's manifesto pledges to tackle teacher shortages, within its work to raise education standards and build opportunity for all New Zealanders. An important factor of quality early childhood education (ECE), and therefore improving standards, is strong learning relationships between and among adults and children. Qualified teachers are more likely than unqualified staff to establish effective learning environments.
3. The previous Government's ECE Strategic Plan set out the goal of a 100% qualified teaching workforce by 2012. Intermediate targets were set – 50% by 2007, 80% by 2010. These targets were supported by a mixture of regulation and funding incentives. Government undertook to meet the cost of additional teachers so that these costs were not passed on to parents, thus ensuring participation was not constrained by the affordability of quality improvements. Currently, the system regulates to 50% teachers, but will fund up to 100% in individual services if teachers are available.
4. It is difficult to quantify the additional impact on quality from additional teachers coming into the system as a result of the previous Government's policies. There is already a strong professional base of qualified teachers in the sector. At this stage, additional teachers are likely to have smaller and decreasing benefits for improving outcomes.
5. Pressure on teacher supply comes from two sources. The funding system increases subsidies to reflect the higher cost of registered teachers up to the previous Government's goal of 100%. Also, many ECE providers expect that the previous Government's teacher registration targets will be regulated, requiring them to meet the target, or be penalised or closed.
6. The 80% 2010 target may not be achievable in over a third of services<sup>1</sup>. There have been significant increases in the ECE teaching workforce – from 5,953 teachers in 2002 to 10,305 in 2008. However, these have been offset by increases in numbers of services, participation, and an uneven distribution of those new teachers across services. The total workforce has grown more quickly than the number of qualified teachers.
- 7.

9(2)(f)(iv)

<sup>1</sup> Estimates of services and teachers affected by changes proposed in this paper are based on the Ministry's teacher supply forecast model, which will change as new data become available.

8. Qualified teachers are less likely to be found in immersion and bilingual services, and services catering to low-income communities. Some evidence indicates that this may be constraining participation for Māori, Pasifika and low-income communities; this will almost certainly be the case if future targets are regulated. Proportions of registered teachers in Māori (51%) and Pasifika (45%) bilingual or immersion services (excluding kōhanga reo) are well below the national average of 61%.

#### Comment

---

9. The key issue is determining whether or not to set an optimal level of workforce qualification to support improved outcomes for children.
10. If you want to set a level, the next choice is how to achieve your desired state, bearing in mind the practicalities of the current teacher shortages and your subsequent manifesto commitment. This paper advises on possible approaches to targets: their timing; whether you wish to regulate for them;

9(2)(f)(iv)

#### Options

11. The three illustrative options below set out different broad trade-offs between giving priority to quality, participation and value for money:
- a. **Keep but do not regulate the 80% 2010 target, and retain the option of keeping or regulating the 100% 2012 target.** This would relieve short-term pressure on the demand for teachers, and remove the risk that services will be placed on provisional licences or closed due to lack of teachers.
  - b. **Extend the timeframe to allow services to meet the 80% target by 2012 and the 100% target by 2015.** This would ease pressure on services and help accommodate any increases in participation, and would retain existing quality goals.
  - c. **Do not regulate the 2010 80% target, and remove the 2012 100% target.** This would provide certainty to the sector, set an achievable target, and
- 9(2)(f)(iv)
12. Options a) or b) would send a strong signal to the sector about the Government's commitment to quality in ECE. Current estimates are that the 2012 target would be achievable, but that would need to be confirmed closer to 2012.
- 9(2)(f)(iv)

#### Releasing pressure on teacher numbers

13. Not regulating or extending the timeframe on the 2010 target would release immediate pressure on teacher numbers. The fact that approximately 30% of teacher-led services meet the 100% target already without regulation suggests that continuing funding for 100% would continue to put pressure on teacher supply. Removing regulation would not completely solve problems of teacher supply, and may constrain participation in the future.

14.

15.

16.

9(2)(f)(iv)

17.

18.

19.

20.

9(2)(f)(iv)

21.

9(2)(f)(iv)

22.

9(2)(f)(iv)

**Risks**

---

*Changes to targets may be seen as compromising quality or future jobs*

23. Services struggling to meet the 80% target would welcome changes to the targets that relieve immediate pressures. However, some parts of the sector would see changes to the targets as compromising quality and outcomes for children.

24. There is a risk that, at current numbers of students in study, a reduction in targets could lead to a surplus of qualified teachers.

25.

9(2)(f)(iv)

26.

27.

9(2)(f)(iv)

28.

29.

### Next Steps

---

30. As a next step, you may wish to seek an in-principle decision from Cabinet not to regulate the 2010 target, and potentially the 2012 target, and announce this to the sector. We can prepare a Cabinet paper to this effect by the end of August.
31. The ECE sector would expect to be consulted on changes to the teacher targets. We can discuss the proposals and their impacts with selected sector groups in confidence, if you wish. This may provide an opportunity to qualify some negative reactions which may occur. There is a risk, however, that consultation would lead to a very public response which could make consideration of the matter difficult.
- 32.

9(2)(f)(iv)

## Appendix One: ECE Teacher Supply Initiatives

- **Incentive Grant:** worth \$2,094 (GST inclusive) a year, to a maximum of \$7,239 over three and a half years, for each successful applicant. The grant is paid to the employing teacher-led ECE service to contribute towards the costs services face when supporting a member of staff to undertake a programme of initial early childhood teacher education that will lead to registration. In 2008, 2,147 incentive grants were allocated, up from 2,099 in 2007, 1,584 in 2006, and 1,220 in 2005, reflecting high levels of awareness of the grant in the sector, and the usefulness of the grant to applicants and early childhood services;
- **Study Grant:** worth \$3,000 as a one-off payment available to: qualified primary teachers who enrol in early childhood teacher education; primary teacher students who transfer to early childhood teacher education; and to degree-holders who enrol in Graduate Diplomas of Teaching (ECE) at specific teacher education providers. In 2008, 180 grants were approved. This compares with the allocation of 212 study grants in 2007, 160 grants in 2006, and 132 grants in 2005;
- **TeachNZ scholarship:** available to low income people and people enrolled in specific programmes equipping them to teach in kaupapa Māori or Pasifika settings. The scholarship pays core course fees, and for full time students an allowance of up to \$10,000 spread over the course of their study for successful completion of each year;
- **Relocation Grants and Return to Teaching Allowance:** International Relocation Grant (up to \$5,000), National Relocation Grant (up to \$3,000), and return to Teaching Allowance (up to \$2,000) are available to qualified and registered early childhood teachers moving to areas defined as "hard to staff". Currently Auckland, Northland, Waikato, and Bay of Plenty are designated as hard-to-staff with provision to review the areas designated hard-to-staff annually;
- **Recognition of Prior Learning:** one free (to the applicant) assessment is offered by five early childhood education providers to accelerate the process of converting existing qualifications and prior learning to a recognised early childhood education teacher qualification;
- **Support Grant for Provisionally Registered Teachers:** worth \$327.83 per month, paid to teacher-led services to support provisionally registered teachers to achieve full registration. The support grant is payable for up to two years or until the teacher becomes fully registered, whichever is the earlier;
- **Recruitment Broker:** recruitment brokers inform interested parties about ECE and provide information about ECE teacher education, teaching in an ECE service and what a career in ECE involves. It was intended that a recruitment broker could inform people of study programmes that are available to them and support people to enrol in a programme.; and
- **Teacher Relief Pool:** the purpose of the pool is to allow the Ministry to place qualified relievers in services in Auckland to cover the times when the staff member who is studying is on practicum.

(4)

4 September 2009

IM60/100/52/3

**Education Report: Cabinet Paper: Tackling ECE Teacher Shortages**

---

**Recommended Actions**

---

We recommend that you:

- a. note the attached draft Cabinet paper seeks Cabinet agreement to changes to the early childhood education (ECE) teacher targets  
9(2)(f)(iv)
- b. comment on the content of the draft Cabinet paper so a final draft can be prepared for Social Policy Committee.

**Karl Le Quesne**  
Group Manager  
Early Childhood Education

enc

NOTED / APPROVED

**Hon Anne Tolley**  
Minister of Education

10/9/09

## **Education Report: Cabinet Paper: Tackling ECE Teacher Shortages**

---

### **Purpose of Report**

---

1. We are seeking your feedback on the attached draft Cabinet paper asking for agreement to changes to the early childhood education (ECE) teacher targets  
9(2)(f)(iv)

### **Background**

---

2. The attached paper seeks Cabinet approval to:
  - move the 2010 80% target to 2012, and remove the 2012 100% target, to ensure high standards are maintained across all ECE services  
9(2)(f)(iv)

9(2)(f)(iv)

3. The draft Cabinet paper is currently circulating with external agencies for comment.

### **Subsequent decisions**

---

4. Cabinet is likely to raise queries about a number of matters that we have not yet advised on. These matters are outlined below.

5.

9(2)(f)(iv)

6.

7.

8.

9(2)(f)(iv)

9.

10.

9(2)(f)(iv)

### **Next Steps**

---

11. **The Ministry is seeking your feedback on the content of the draft Cabinet paper so a final draft can be prepared for Cabinet Social Policy Committee.**

In Confidence

Office of the Minister of Education

Cabinet Social Policy Committee

**Tackling Early Childhood Education Teacher Shortages**

**Proposal**

1. I seek Cabinet agreement to set a target of 80% registered teachers across the early childhood education (ECE) sector by 2012 (with the intention of requiring at least 50% registered teachers for under two year olds).

9(2)(f)(iv)

**Executive Summary**

2. Our government is committed to higher standards in education, and to boosting participation in early childhood education (ECE). Qualified teachers are an important part of high standards in education, in early childhood as in schools. High quality ECE ensures children get a good start to their education and go on to achieve more. Our manifesto promised to tackle teacher shortages in early childhood because a lack of registered teachers in some ECE services is currently limiting our ability to achieve our quality and participation goals.
3. The previous Government's ECE strategic plan set out the goal of a fully registered teaching workforce in ECE by 2012, with an intermediate target of 80% in 2010. Registered teachers are important, but a fully registered workforce is not necessary to achieve high standards. The targets are costly to government, and are generating significant pressure on ECE services, as the intermediate 2010 target of 80% may not be achievable in over a third of services.
4. The ECE sector is concerned that the 80% target will be regulated in 2010, which may force some services to close. I do not believe closing services is sensible, or necessary to achieving high standards.
5. In this paper I propose Cabinet agree two measures, in line with our manifesto, to ensure that enough teachers are available to maintain high standards, while also ensuring ECE participation is not compromised by unrealistic targets and

9(2)(f)(iv)

- (i) moving the 2010 80% target to 2012, and removing the 2012 100% target, to ensure sufficiently high standards across all ECE services are maintained

9(2)(f)(iv)

(ii)

9(2)(f)(iv)

6.

9(2)(f)(iv)

7.

9(2)(f)(iv)

### **Background**

8. Our government is committed to higher standards in education. Registered teachers are an important part of high standards in education, in early childhood as in schools.
9. ECE that is of a high standard helps prepare children for lifelong learning, engages whānau in education and gives parents the confidence to use ECE. An important factor of quality ECE, and therefore improving standards, is strong learning relationships between and among adults and children. Qualified teachers are more likely than unqualified staff to establish effective learning environments, and are vital to driving high standards in ECE.
10. A key government priority for ECE is boosting participation, particularly for Māori and Pasifika children and children from low socio-economic backgrounds. All children should have the opportunity to benefit from high quality ECE. Our manifesto promised to tackle teacher shortages in ECE because a lack of registered ECE teachers is limiting our ability to achieve these goals.

### *Pressure on ECE services*

11. The previous Government's ECE strategic plan set out the goal of a 100% registered teaching workforce by 2012. Intermediate targets were set – 50% by 2007, 80% by 2010. These targets were supported by a mixture of regulation and funding incentives. Government meets the cost of additional teachers so that these costs are not passed on to parents, ensuring participation is not constrained by the affordability of quality improvements. Currently, the system regulates to 50% registered teachers, but will fund to 100% if the teachers are available.
12. The 80% 2010 target may not be achievable in over a third of services<sup>1</sup>. There have been significant increases in the ECE teaching workforce – from 4,242 registered teachers in 2002 to 10,320 in 2008. However, the impact of these increases has been diluted by increases in numbers of services, participation, and an uneven distribution of those new teachers across services.
13. Registered teachers are less likely to be found in immersion and bilingual services, and services catering to low-income communities. Some evidence indicates that this may be constraining participation for Māori, Pasifika and low-income communities. Proportions of registered teachers in Māori (51%) and Pasifika (45%) bilingual or immersion services (excluding kōhanga reo) are well below the national average of 61%.
14. The ECE sector is concerned that the 2010 target of 80% will be regulated and services will have to close as a result. This is driving wage inflation, fierce competition for qualified teachers, and the uneven distribution of teachers noted above.

---

<sup>1</sup> Estimates of services and teachers affected by changes proposed in this paper are based on the Ministry's teacher supply forecast model, which is subject to change as new data become available.

15. While registered teachers are important to high standards, a 100% registered workforce is not necessary to achieve this. I do not believe regulation of the 80% target next year, or pursuing a 100% registered workforce, is sensible or necessary to achieving high standards in ECE.

**Proposals to tackle ECE teacher shortages**

*Teacher registration targets – removing pressure*

16. I recommend that Cabinet set a target of 80% registered teachers in 2012, and that we no longer set a fully registered workforce as a target. Announcing this to the sector will provide certainty about an achievable target,

9(2)(f)(iv)

17. Evidence does not indicate an optimal proportion of the ECE teaching workforce that should be qualified but it does show strong links between teacher qualifications and better educational outcomes for children. Setting a target of 80% registered teachers will maintain high standards across all services and give all children the opportunity to attend high quality ECE.

18. Seeking a target of 80% by 2012 will also help ensure that ECE services are in a strong position to implement our manifesto commitment that, after 2012, sessions for under-twos should be staffed by at least 50% registered teachers.

19. We do not require any legislative change to set a new target. I would like to be able to announce a new target to the ECE sector as soon as possible, to provide them with assurance about our intentions.

20.

21.

22.

9(2)(f)(iv)

23.

24.

25.

26.

27

28.

9(2)(f)(iv)

29.

30.

31

32.

33.

34.

9(2)(f)(iv)

35.

**Risks**

*Changes to targets may be seen as compromising quality or future jobs*

36. Services struggling to meet the 2010 target would welcome changes to the targets that relieve immediate pressures. However, some parts of the education sector would see changes to the targets as compromising quality and outcomes for children.

37. There is a risk that, at current numbers of students in study, a reduction in targets could lead to a surplus of qualified teachers.

38.

9(2)(f)(iv)

39.

9(2)(f)(iv)

40.

### **Next Steps**

41. Proposals in this paper will help ease demand for registered ECE teachers. However, some services (particularly bilingual and immersion services and services in low socio-economic or rural and isolated communities) may continue to be less able to recruit and retain registered teachers.

9(2)(f)(iv)

42.

9(2)(f)(iv)

### **Consultation**

43. The following agencies have been consulted during the development of this paper: the Ministries of Social Development, Women's Affairs, and Pacific Island Affairs, Department of Labour, Treasury, the State Services Commission, Te Puni Kōkiri and the Tertiary Education Commission.

44. New Zealand Qualifications Authority and New Zealand Teachers Council have been consulted on the provisions relating to their role and function.

45. A copy of this paper has been provided to the Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet.

### **Human Rights Implications**

46. The proposals in this paper appear to be consistent with the Human Rights Act 1993 and the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990.

### **Legislative Implications**

47. There are no direct legislative implications arising from this paper.

9(2)(f)(iv)

### **Gender Implications**

48. The proposals contained in this report do not have any gender implications.

### **Disability perspective**

49. The proposals contained in this report do not have any disability implications.

### **Publicity**

50. I seek permission to announce the changes to the teacher registration targets following today's decision to relieve short-term pressure on the ECE sector.

**Recommendations**

51. The Minister of Education recommends that the Committee:

- 51.1. **note** that registered teachers are an important part of high standards in education, in early childhood as in schools;
- 51.2. **note** that the previous Government's teacher targets are putting pressure on services and contributing to a shortage of qualified and registered ECE teachers;
- 51.3. **note** that increasing participation in teacher-led early childhood services is linked to the availability of registered early childhood teachers;
- 51.4. **agree** that the 2010 80% target be moved out to 2012, and remove the 2012 100% target;
- 51.5. **agree** that the decision to revise the target be announced to alleviate immediate pressure on ECE teacher supply;

51.6.

51.7.

51.8.

9(2)(f)(iv)

51.9.

51.10.

51.11.

Hon Anne Tolley  
Minister of Education

**Education Report: Cabinet Paper: Tackling ECE Teacher Shortages**

**Recommended Actions**

We recommend that you:

- a. **note** the attached draft Cabinet paper seeks Cabinet agreement to:
  - 1) changes to the early childhood education (ECE) teacher targets;
  - 2) **9(2)(f)(iv)**
- b. **indicate** any changes you would like made to the Cabinet paper;
- c. **note** the Ministry of Education has submitted the Cabinet paper to the Officials' Social Policy Committee secretary for consideration at its 29 September 2009 meeting; *changes have been included in attached paper.*
- d. **sign** and submit the attached paper to Cabinet Office by 10.00am 8 October 2009 for consideration at the Cabinet Social Policy Committee meeting on 14 October 2009; and
- e. **note** we will provide an aide memoire for the Cabinet Social Policy Committee meeting by Wednesday 7 October 2009.

**Karl Le Quesne**  
Group Manager  
Early Childhood Education

encs

NOTED / APPROVED

**Hon Anne Tolley**  
Minister of Education

*5/10/09*

---

## **Education Report: Cabinet Paper: Tackling ECE Teacher Shortages**

---

### **Purpose of Report**

---

1. The attached paper seeks Cabinet agreement to changes to the early childhood education (ECE) teacher targets 9(2)(f)(iv)

### **Background**

---

2. The attached paper seeks Cabinet approval to:
  - move the 2010 80% target to 2012, and remove the 2012 100% target, to ensure high standards are maintained across all ECE services 9(2)(f)(iv)

9(2)(f)(iv)

### **External consultation**

---

3. The Ministry of Education consulted the following agencies during the development of this paper: the Ministries of Social Development, Women's Affairs, and Pacific Island Affairs, Department of Labour, Treasury, the State Services Commission, Te Puni Kōkiri and the Tertiary Education Commission.
  4. The key matters raised in consultation were:
    - 
    -
- 9(2)(f)(iv)
5. The New Zealand Qualifications Authority and the New Zealand Teachers Council have been consulted on the proposals relating to their role and function. The Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet has also been informed.

---

6. 9(2)(f)(iv)

7. 9(2)(f)(iv)

8. 9(2)(f)(iv)

### Comment

---

9. The costs and savings presented in the Cabinet paper are based on Budget-night (BEFU09) forecasts.

9(2)(f)(iv)

The Ministry will provide an update once the forecast is complete in mid-October.

### Next Steps

---

10. The proposed timing for the progress of this paper to Cabinet is outlined in the table below.

24 September 2009	Cabinet paper sent to Minister's office and submitted to OSOC secretary
29 September 2009	Cabinet paper at OSOC
8 October 2009	Paper submitted to Cabinet office by 10am
14 October 2009	Cabinet paper at SOC

*Cabinet paper resubmitted with slight change to your office 10 October 2009.*

## Tackling Early Childhood Education Teacher Shortages

### Proposal

1. To relieve immediate pressure on teacher supply in early childhood education (ECE), I seek Cabinet agreement to set a target of 80% registered teachers across the ECE sector by 2012 (with the intention of requiring at least 50% registered teachers for under two year olds).

9(2)(f)(iv)

### Executive Summary

2. Our Government is committed to higher standards in education, and to boosting participation in ECE. Registered teachers play an important role in maintaining high standards in education, in early childhood as in schools. High quality ECE ensures children get a good start to their education. Our manifesto promised to tackle teacher shortages in early childhood because a lack of registered teachers in some ECE services is limiting our ability to achieve our quality and participation goals.
3. The previous Government's ECE strategic plan set out the goal of a fully registered teaching workforce in ECE by 2012, with an intermediate target of 80% in 2010. Registered teachers are important, but evidence does not suggest that a fully registered workforce is necessary to achieve high standards. Achieving a fully registered workforce is costly to government, and is generating significant pressure on ECE services, as the intermediate 2010 target of 80% may not be achievable in over a third of services.
4. The ECE sector is concerned that Government intends to regulate the 80% target in 2010, which may force some services to close. This is driving competition for registered teachers and contributing to an uneven distribution of registered teachers across services. I do not believe closing services is a practical solution, or necessary to achieving high standards.
5. In this paper I propose Cabinet agree two measures, in line with our manifesto, to ensure that enough teachers are available to maintain high standards, while ensuring ECE participation is not compromised by unrealistic targets and  
9(2)(f)(iv)
  - (i) moving the 2010 80% target to 2012, and removing the 2012 100% target, to maintain sufficiently high standards across all ECE services 9(2)(f)(iv)  
Announcing this to the sector will provide certainty about an achievable target and alleviate immediate pressure on services; and

(ii)

9(2)(f)(iv)

## 9(2)(f)(iv)

**Background**

7. Our Government is committed to higher standards in education. Registered teachers play an important role in maintaining high standards in education, in early childhood as in schools.
8. ECE that is of a high standard helps prepare children for lifelong learning, engages whānau in education and gives parents the confidence to use ECE. An important factor of quality ECE, and therefore improving standards, is strong learning relationships between and among adults and children. Qualified teachers are more likely than unqualified staff to establish effective learning environments, and drive high standards in ECE.
9. A key government priority for ECE is boosting participation, particularly for children from Māori, Pasifika and low socio-economic communities. All children should have the opportunity to benefit from high quality ECE. Our manifesto promised to tackle teacher shortages in ECE because a lack of registered ECE teachers is limiting our ability to achieve these goals.

*Pressure on ECE services*

10. The previous Government's ECE strategic plan set out the goal of a 100% registered teaching workforce by 2012. Intermediate targets were set – 50% by 2007, 80% by 2010.
11. These targets are supported by a mixture of regulation and funding incentives. Licensing regulations require teacher-led services to have 50% qualified ECE teachers. Government meets the cost of additional teachers so that these costs are not passed on to parents, ensuring participation is not constrained by the affordability of quality improvements. If the teachers are available, the system will fund up to 100% registered teachers.
12. The 80% 2010 target may not be achievable in over a third of services.<sup>1</sup> This risk is greater for Māori immersion and Pasifika services. There have been significant increases in the ECE teaching workforce – from 4,242 registered teachers in 2002 to 10,320 in 2008. However, the impact of these increases has been diluted by increases in numbers of services, participation, and an uneven distribution of new teachers across services.
13. Registered teachers are less likely to be found in immersion and bilingual services, and services catering to low-income communities. Some evidence indicates that this may be constraining participation for Māori, Pasifika and low-income communities. The proportion of registered ECE teachers nationally is 61% compared with 51% and 45% in Māori and Pasifika bilingual or immersion services (excluding kōhanga reo which are not subject to the teacher targets).
14. The ECE sector is concerned that the 2010 target of 80% will be regulated and services not meeting that requirement will have to close as a result. This is driving wage inflation, fierce competition for qualified teachers, and the uneven distribution of teachers noted above.

<sup>1</sup> Estimates of services and teachers affected by changes proposed in this paper are based on the Ministry's teacher supply forecast model, which is subject to change as new data become available.

~~15. Registered teachers are important to high standards, but a 100% registered workforce is not necessary to achieve this~~ 9(2)(f)(iv)

I do not believe regulating the 80% target next year, or pursuing a 100% registered workforce, would be sensible or necessary to achieving high standards in ECE.

#### Proposals to tackle ECE teacher shortages

##### *Teacher registration targets – removing pressure*

16. I recommend that Cabinet move the 2010 target of 80% registered teachers out to 2012, and that we no longer set a fully registered workforce as a target. Announcing this to the sector will provide certainty about an achievable target, ease pressure on ECE services 9(2)(f)(iv)

17. Evidence does not indicate an optimal proportion of the ECE teaching workforce that should be qualified but it does show strong links between teacher qualifications and better educational outcomes for children.

18. Current regulations require at least 50% of staff in teacher-led ECE services to hold a recognised ECE qualification. Aiming to raise this to 80% by 2012 will help support high standards across all services and contribute to increasing opportunities for children to attend high quality ECE.

19. Initial forecasts indicate that 80% registered teachers by 2012 will be achievable at a national level. Because of this, I do not intend to regulate for 80% in 2012 at this stage. Reaching 80% by 2012 will also help ensure that ECE services are in a strong position to implement our manifesto commitment that, after 2012, sessions for children under two years old should be staffed by at least 50% registered teachers.

20. Most kōhanga are not subject to the qualified teacher requirements, but kaiako (teachers) are encouraged instead to complete the *Whakapakari Tohu* qualification. Therefore, this proposal will have little impact for the children that attend kōhanga, who make up 25% of Māori enrolments. Te Kōhanga Reo National Trust, Te Puni Kōkiri and the Ministry of Education are discussing ways to support sustainability, quality and funding for kōhanga reo.

21.

9(2)(f)(iv)

22. We do not require any legislative changes to set a new target as I do not intend to regulate at this stage. I plan to announce a revised target to ECE providers as soon as possible to provide assurance about our objectives.

23.

9(2)(f)(iv)

24.

---

---

25.

26.

27.

28.

29.

9(2)(f)(iv)

30.

31.

32.

33.

9(2)(f)(iv)

34.

35.

36.

### **Risks**

#### *Changes to targets may be seen as compromising quality or future jobs*

37. Services struggling to meet the 2010 target would welcome changes that relieve immediate pressures. However, some parts of the education sector would see changes to the targets as compromising quality and outcomes for children.

38. Initial projections indicate that there is a risk that lowering the targets could lead to a surplus of qualified teachers at a national level. However, it is likely that there would be an uneven distribution of teachers in some regions. Greater targeting of areas that are difficult to staff could help employ any surplus teachers.

39.

9(2)(f)(iv)

41.

9(2)(f)(iv)

42.

#### **Next Steps**

43. Proposals in this paper would help ease demand for registered ECE teachers. However, some services (particularly bilingual and immersion services and services in low socio-economic or rural and isolated communities) may continue to be less able to recruit and retain registered teachers.

9(2)(f)(iv)

44.

9(2)(f)(iv)

#### **Consultation**

45. The following agencies were consulted during the development of this paper and their comments have been reflected: the Ministries of Social Development, Women's Affairs, and Pacific Island Affairs, Department of Labour, Treasury, the State Services Commission, Te Puni Kōkiri and the Tertiary Education Commission.

46. New Zealand Qualifications Authority and New Zealand Teachers Council have been consulted on the provisions relating to their role and function.

47. A copy of this paper has been provided to the Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet.

---

## **Human Rights Implications**

---

48. The proposals in this paper appear to be consistent with the Human Rights Act 1993 and the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990.

### **Legislative Implications**

49. There are no direct legislative implications arising from this paper.

9(2)(f)(iv)

### **Gender Implications**

50. The proposals contained in this paper are likely to have a positive impact on mothers' ability to participate in the labour market.

### **Disability perspective**

51. The proposals contained in this report do not have any disability implications.

### **Publicity**

52. I intend to announce the changes to the teacher registration targets following Cabinet's decision to relieve short-term pressure on the ECE sector. The key messages are:

- 52.1. Government is committed to higher standards in education;
- 52.2. registered teachers play an important role in maintaining high standards in education, in early childhood as in schools;
- 52.3. the 80% registered teacher target is not achievable by 2010;
- 52.4. in the current economic climate, Government has to make difficult fiscal decisions. A 100% registered workforce is not affordable;
- 52.5. I plan to move the 2010 80% target to 2012 and remove the 2012 100% target; and,
- 52.6. achieving 80% registered teachers in teacher-led services will help maintain sufficiently high standards across all ECE services while easing the pressure on ECE services and controlling increasing costs.

### **Recommendations**

53. I recommend that the Committee:

- 53.1. note that registered teachers play an important role in maintaining high standards in education, in early childhood as in schools;
- 53.2. note that increasing participation in teacher-led early childhood services is linked to the availability of registered early childhood teachers;
- 53.3. note that the previous Government's teacher targets are putting pressure on services and contributing to a shortage of qualified and registered ECF teachers;

53.4. agree to the following changes to the ECE teacher registration targets:

---

53.4.1. move the 2010 80% target out to 2012 with no intention of regulating at this stage; and

53.4.2. remove the 2012 100% target;

53.5.

53.6.

53.7. 9(2)(f)(iv)

53.8.

53.9.

53.10. note that I will announce a revised target to ECE providers as soon as possible to alleviate immediate pressure on ECE teacher supply and provide assurance about our objectives.

Hon' Anne Tolley  
Minister of Education

5/10/09

6

9 October 2009

IM60/100/52/3

**Education Report: ECE Teacher Targets: Aide Memoire for SOC meeting on 14 October 2009**

---

**Recommended Actions**

---

We recommend that you:

- a. note that at the meeting on 14 October 2009, Cabinet Social Policy Committee is considering your paper seeking approval to:
  - i) change the early childhood education (ECE) teacher targets
  - ii) 9(2)(f)(iv)
  
- b. note an aide memoire for this meeting is attached.

**Karl Le Quesne**  
Group Manager  
Early Childhood Education

encs

**Hon Anne Tolley**  
Minister of Education

11/10/09

**Aide Memoire: Cabinet Social Policy Committee 14 October  
2009 - ECE Teacher Targets**

---

**Purpose**

---

You propose to tackle teacher shortages in early childhood education (ECE) while maintaining high standards in ECE provision. Talking points and further information have been provided below.

**Proposals**

---

**Extend the 2010 ECE 80% teacher registration target to 2012, and remove the 2012 100% target (paragraphs 16-22 of the Cabinet paper)**

1. The previous Government set a goal of a 100% registered ECE teaching workforce by 2012. It set intermediate goals – 50% by 2007, 80% by 2010. The 80% target by 2010 may not be achievable in over a third of services (approximately 1000 services).
2. I propose extending the 2010 80% target to 2012, and removing the 2012 100% target. This will help alleviate immediate pressure on services and maintain high standards across all ECE services 9(2)(f)(iv)
3. It is important that I announce this to the sector before January 2010 to provide certainty.
4. Evidence does not suggest that a fully registered workforce is necessary to achieve high standards. 9(2)(f)(iv)
5. Initial forecasts indicate that 80% registered teachers by 2012 will be achievable at a national level. Because of this, I do not intend to regulate 80% in 2012. I will reconsider the matter closer to 2012 when more information will be available.
- 6.
- 7.
8. 9(2)(f)(iv)
- 9.
- 10.
- 11.

**Further information**

---

12.

**9(2)(f)(iv)**

13.



# Cabinet Social Policy Committee

SOC Min (09) 23/4

Copy No: 29

## Minute of Decision

*This document contains information for the New Zealand Cabinet. It must be treated in confidence and handled in accordance with any security classification, or other endorsement. The information can only be released, including under the Official Information Act 1982, by persons with the appropriate authority.*

### Tackling Teacher Shortages in Early Childhood Education

Portfolio: Education

19 OCT 2009

On 14 October 2009, the Cabinet Social Policy Committee:

- 1 noted that registered teachers play an important role in maintaining high standards in education, in early childhood as in schools;
- 2 noted that increasing participation in teacher-led early childhood services is linked to the availability of registered early childhood teachers;
- 3 noted that the previous government's teacher targets are putting pressure on services and contributing to a shortage of qualified and registered early childhood education (ECE) teachers;

#### ECE Teacher Registration Targets

- 4 agreed to the following changes to the ECE teacher registration targets:
  - 4.1 move the 2010 target of 80 per cent teacher registration out to 2012 with no intention of regulating at this time;
  - 4.2 remove the 2012 target of 100 per cent teacher registration;
- 5 noted that the Minister of Education will announce the revised targets to ECE providers as soon as possible to alleviate immediate pressure on ECE teacher supply and provide assurance about the government's objectives;

6

9(2)(f)(iv)

7

7.1

9(2)(f)(iv)

7.2

9(2)(f)(iv)

8

9

9(2)(f)(iv)

10